## STATE OF RHODE ISLAND NEWPORT, Sc.

## HISTORIC DISTRIC COMMISSION CITY OF NEWPORT

In Re:

October-22 Application of Mr. and Mrs. Les Helmers, 28 Ann Street, Plat 27, Lot 155 for permission to raise ridge line 4' while maintaining the traditional eave profiles and returns. Extend the chimney to match as per code. Add shed dormer on back side of house. Replace later era windows with the more historically appropriate 12 over 12 windows. Repair and install an interior energy panel to preserve original fenestration. Demarcate the original from latter era building with applied corner boards to better visually delineate the evolutionary history of the structure.

## **DECISION**

This matter came before the Newport Historic District Commission on October 15, 2019; November 19, 2019; and January 21, 2020. Mr. Ross Cann, architect, was present to represent application at each of these three hearings.

The following testimony was heard on the matter:

- 1. On October 15, 2019 Mr. Ross Cann presented the application to the Commission.
- 2. The commission voiced concerns about changing the existing building from 2.5 stories to 3 stories and the massing a scale of the proposed addition citing that the proposed changes were too much for a contributing structure. A suggestion was made to create less space between window and roofline or change pitch of proposed roof.
- 3. The commission requested that the application be continued to the November 19, 2019 Historic District Commission meeting. Mr. Cann agreed to the continuance.
- 4. Mr. Cann submitted updated drawings based on the Commission's comments and returned to represent the application at the November 19, 2019 Historic District Commission meeting.
- 5. The commission still had concerns about the proposed change in roofline and voiced additional concerns about the proposed change to the historic chimney. Commission member O'Brien specifically cited standard 17.80.060.A.7 and stated that the historic nature of the building must be preserved.

1 2

- 6. The commission requested that the application be continued to the December 17, 2019 Historic District Commission meeting. Mr. Cann agreed to the continuance.
- 7. The application was continued to the January 21, 2020 Historic District Commission meeting at the request of the applicant.
- 8. Mr. Cann submitted updated drawings based on the Commission's comments and returned to represent the application at the January 21, 2020 Historic District Commission meeting.

After consideration of testimony and evidence introduced at hearing, the Commission considered the following as findings of fact:

- 1. 28 Ann Street is located in the Newport National Historic Landmark District and the Newport Local Historic District.
- 2. 28 Ann Street was constructed circa 1810 and is listed as a contributing building.
- 3. The applicable Newport Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties are:
- **17.80.060.A.1. Retain Historic Character -** Retain and preserve the historic character of a Contributing Structure. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a Contributing Structure should not be undertaken.
- **17.80.060.A.2. Avoid Conjecture -** The buildings of Newport are a physical record of their time, place and use. Avoid changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding a conjectural feature or architectural elements from other buildings.
- **17.80.060.A.3. Maintain Significant Alterations -** Retain and preserve changes to a Contributing Structure that have acquired historic significance in their own right.
- **17.80.060.A.4. Preserve Character Defining Features and Workmanship -** Preserve distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a Contributing Structure.
- **17.80.060.A.5. Repair before Replacement** The historic materials out of which Contributing Structures buildings are constructed are significant and once lost, they cannot be recovered. Every effort should be made to repair rather than replace deteriorated historic fabric and features. When the severity of deterioration requires replacement of features or fabric, the replacement should match the old in materials, dimensions, design, configuration, texture and visual appearance.
- **17.80.060.A.6. Avoid Damaging Treatments** Do not use chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials.

Mr. and Mrs. Les Helmers, 28 Ann Street, Plat 27, Lot 155 Decision

17.80.060.A.7. Minimize Harm from Alterations – Undertake exterior alterations, including new additions, in such a manner that minimizes harm to historic materials and that if removed will not change the essential form and integrity of a Contributing Structure. Make proposed additions or exterior alterations to a Contributing Structure compatible with the existing materials, features, size, visual relationships and massing to protect the integrity and scale of the original historic structure or site. Make new alterations or additions clearly discernible from the old. The differentiations may or may not be stylistic, and may be as subtle as a change in footprint or material.

Upon a motion duly made and seconded, the Commission adopted the staff report's finding of facts as their own.

Upon a motion duly made and seconded, the Commission found that the proposed changes being in conflict with the aforementioned Newport Standards for Treatment of Historic Properties; therefore the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness was denied on a 5-2 vote. Diana Sylvaria, Howard Elliott, Joanna Salvo, Rosemary O'Brien, and Nancy Stafford voted nay. Karl Bjork and Jeffrey Moniz voted in favor.

The application failed to receive four or a majority of affirmative votes from the seven members voting, therefore pursuant to Section 17.88.040(C)(3)(f) of the code, the application was denied.

Karl Bjork, Chair	
Diana Sylvaria, Vice Chair	
Nancy Stafford Secretary	